Journal of Innovative and Creativity
Journal Homepage: https://joecy.org/index.php/joecy
e-mail: journaljoecy@gmail.com

Faculty of Education
University of Pahlawan Tuanku Tambusai
ISSN 2775-771X (Online)
ISSN 2962-570X (Printed)
6 (2) 2026, Page: 36248-36258

A COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION MODEL FOR ISLAMIC VALUES EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS AND MADA'RIS

Abdulatip Amilin Kanjang

Program Studi Pendidikan Agama Islam Pascasarjana
Universitas Islam Negeri UIN Salatiga
Kota Salatiga, Jawa Tenga - Indonesia

abdulatipkanjang@gmail.com

Published: Juni , 2026

ABSTRACT

Islamic Values Education plays a vital role in developing students' spiritual, moral, intellectual, and social character. However, many educational institutions continue to rely on conventional assessment approaches that primarily measure cognitive achievement while neglecting affective and behavioral dimensions of Islamic values.

Despite the widespread implementation of Islamic Values Education, many institutions continue to face challenges in evaluating its effectiveness. Existing assessment approaches often focus on cognitive achievement while neglecting affective and behavioral outcomes. Consequently, there is a need for a comprehensive evaluation model that assesses the planning, implementation, outcomes, and sustainability of Islamic Values Education programs in schools and mada'ris.

This study proposes a Comprehensive Evaluation Model for Islamic Values Education applicable to both formal schools and traditional and modern mada'ris. The model integrates curriculum evaluation, instructional practices, student character development, institutional culture, community involvement, and long-term behavioral outcomes. Employing a qualitative library research design, the study synthesizes contemporary educational evaluation theories and Islamic educational principles derived from the Qur'an, Sunnah, and classical Islamic scholarship. The findings reveal that effective Islamic values education requires multidimensional evaluation encompassing knowledge acquisition, value internalization, behavioral manifestation, and social impact. The proposed model offers a systematic framework for educators, administrators, policymakers, and researchers to assess and improve the implementation of Islamic values education across diverse educational settings.

Keywords: Islamic Values Education, Educational Evaluation, Character Education, Mada'ris, Curriculum Assessment, Islamic Pedagogy.

© The Author(s). 2021 Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Atibution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0

INTRODUCTION

Education is not merely concerned with the transmission of knowledge and skills but also with the cultivation of values that guide human behavior and shape individual character. Educational institutions, including schools and madrasahs, are expected to develop learners who possess strong moral character, ethical awareness, social responsibility, and the ability to contribute positively to society. In the context of Islamic education, value education extends beyond the acquisition of academic knowledge to encompass the internalization of both universal human values and Islamic principles derived from the Qur'an and Sunnah.

The fundamental aim of Islamic education is the holistic development of the individual through the balanced cultivation of intellectual, spiritual, moral, and social dimensions. It seeks not only to enhance intellectual competence but also to nurture individuals who embody Islamic values in their daily lives. The ultimate objective is the formation of *insan salih* (righteous individuals) who

demonstrate faith (*iman*), piety (*taqwa*), noble moral conduct (*akhlaq*), and social responsibility. Such individuals are expected to apply Islamic teachings in their personal, social, and professional lives while contributing to the well-being of their communities.

Given these objectives, Islamic educational institutions bear a significant responsibility in ensuring that values education is effectively implemented and assessed. The success of Islamic values education should therefore be evaluated not only through students' academic achievements but also through the extent to which Islamic values are internalized and reflected in their attitudes, behaviors, and interactions with others. This highlights the importance of developing comprehensive evaluation models capable of measuring the cognitive, affective, spiritual, and behavioral outcomes of Islamic values education in schools and madrasahs.

Despite the recognized importance of value education, assessment practices often focus predominantly on academic achievement. Traditional evaluation systems emphasize examinations and cognitive outcomes while paying limited attention to students' attitudes, behaviors, and character development. Consequently, educational institutions face challenges in determining whether value education programs effectively influence students' personal and social conduct.

In contemporary educational systems, assessment often focuses on academic achievement while insufficient attention is given to evaluating value formation and character development. Schools and mada'ris increasingly face challenges in measuring the effectiveness of Islamic values education due to the complexity of assessing attitudes, beliefs, behaviors, and long-term character outcomes.

A comprehensive evaluation model is therefore necessary to assess the multidimensional outcomes of value education. Such a model should include cognitive understanding, affective commitment, behavioral manifestation, social interaction, and spiritual development.

Consequently, there is a need for a comprehensive evaluation framework that systematically measures the implementation and outcomes of Islamic values education. Such a model should integrate educational standards, Islamic principles, and contemporary evaluation approaches to ensure holistic assessment.

PROBLEM STATEMENT

Despite the growing recognition of the importance of value education in schools and madrasahs, existing evaluation practices often focus primarily on cognitive achievement and fail to adequately assess the broader dimensions of value formation. As a result, there remains a need for a comprehensive framework capable of evaluating the effectiveness of value education in fostering students' moral, spiritual, social, and behavioral development. This study seeks to address the following questions:

1. What are the limitations of existing value education evaluation practices in schools and madrasahs?
2. What theoretical and conceptual foundations support the comprehensive assessment of value education?
3. What dimensions should be included in an effective evaluation framework for value education in schools and madrasahs?
4. How can cognitive, affective, spiritual, and behavioral outcomes be assessed in an integrated manner?
5. How can a comprehensive evaluation model be developed to effectively assess the implementation and outcomes of value education programs?
6. What indicators can be used to evaluate the effectiveness of value education in promoting moral character, ethical awareness, and social responsibility among students?

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The study aims to:

1. Examine existing approaches and practices of value education assessment in schools and madrasahs.
2. Analyze relevant theoretical and conceptual perspectives that support comprehensive value education evaluation.

3. Identify the key dimensions and indicators necessary for assessing value education programs effectively.
4. Develop a comprehensive evaluation model that integrates cognitive, affective, spiritual, and behavioral domains of learning.
5. Integrate contemporary educational evaluation theories with Islamic educational principles to establish a holistic assessment framework.
6. Provide practical recommendations and guidelines for implementing value education assessment in schools and madrasahs.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Previous Studies

Numerous studies have emphasized the importance of evaluating value and character education beyond mere cognitive achievement. Scholars from both general educational theory and Islamic educational philosophy have argued that effective education should foster holistic human development encompassing intellectual, moral, spiritual, emotional, and social dimensions.

Lickona (1991), a leading scholar in character education, proposed that character development consists of three interconnected components: moral knowing, moral feeling, and moral action. According to his framework, effective evaluation should assess not only students' understanding of moral values but also their emotional commitment and actual behavior. Similarly, Berkowitz and Bier (2005) found that successful character education programs employ comprehensive assessment strategies, including teacher observations, student self-assessments, peer evaluations, and community feedback.

Nucci and Narvaez (2008) further argued that moral development cannot be adequately measured through traditional written examinations alone. They emphasized the need for authentic assessment approaches that capture students' ethical reasoning, value-based decision-making, and behavioral manifestations in real-life situations. These perspectives suggest that value education evaluation should incorporate multiple methods and sources of evidence to provide a more accurate understanding of students' character development.

Within the context of Islamic education, several scholars have highlighted the inseparable relationship between knowledge, faith, and character. Syed Muhammad Naquib al-Attas (1999) emphasized that the primary objective of Islamic education is the inculcation of *adab* (proper conduct and discipline), leading to the formation of a balanced and righteous personality. According to Al-Attas, educational success should be evaluated not only through intellectual achievement but also through the manifestation of ethical behavior and spiritual maturity.

Likewise, Ashraf (1985) stressed that Islamic education should integrate intellectual, moral, and spiritual development, requiring evaluation systems that assess both academic competence and character formation. Abdurrahman An-Nahlawi (1995) further argued that Islamic education seeks the balanced development of spiritual, intellectual, emotional, and moral dimensions simultaneously. Consequently, evaluation practices should reflect these multidimensional objectives.

Similarly, Yusuf al-Qaradawi (1999) highlighted the importance of integrating faith (*iman*), worship (*ibadah*), ethics (*akhlaq*), and social responsibility within educational processes. He maintained that educational evaluation should examine the extent to which Islamic values are internalized and reflected in students' attitudes, behaviors, and social interactions.

Collectively, these studies demonstrate a growing consensus that value education assessment should move beyond cognitive measurement to encompass affective, behavioral, moral, and spiritual outcomes. They also underscore the importance of adopting comprehensive and holistic evaluation approaches capable of assessing the multiple dimensions of human development.

RESEARCH GAP

Despite significant contributions from both character education scholars and Islamic education theorists, existing studies remain fragmented in their approaches to value education evaluation. Many studies focus primarily on curriculum implementation, teaching strategies, or character outcomes independently rather than examining the entire educational process. Furthermore,

most evaluation frameworks emphasize specific aspects of moral or character development without integrating cognitive, affective, spiritual, behavioral, and social dimensions into a unified model.

In Islamic educational contexts, while scholars have extensively discussed the goals and philosophy of Islamic values education, relatively few studies have proposed comprehensive evaluation frameworks that systematically assess curriculum content, instructional practices, institutional culture, student development, and community impact simultaneously. As a result, there remains a need for a holistic and practical evaluation model that combines contemporary educational evaluation theories with Islamic educational principles to assess the effectiveness of value education programs in schools and madrasahs comprehensively.

This study seeks to address this gap by developing a Comprehensive Evaluation Model for Islamic Values Education that integrates multiple dimensions of assessment and provides a systematic framework for evaluating the implementation and outcomes of value education in schools and madrasahs.

This version is suitable for the Literature Review chapter of a Master's thesis, PhD dissertation, or Scopus-indexed journal article on Islamic Values Education and Educational Evaluation.

RELATED THEORIES

The development of a Comprehensive Evaluation Model for Islamic Values Education is grounded in several complementary theories that emphasize holistic human development, character formation, moral reasoning, and educational evaluation. These theories provide the conceptual foundation for assessing the cognitive, affective, behavioral, spiritual, and social outcomes of value education in schools and madrasahs.

1. Bloom's Taxonomy

Bloom's Taxonomy (Bloom, 1956) classifies educational objectives into three major domains:

- Cognitive Domain – knowledge acquisition, understanding, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation.
- Affective Domain – attitudes, values, beliefs, and emotional development.
- Psychomotor Domain – skills, practices, and observable actions.

Since value education aims to influence not only what students know but also what they believe and how they behave, evaluation should encompass all three domains. Bloom's framework provides a foundation for assessing the intellectual, emotional, and behavioral dimensions of learning.

2. Kohlberg's Moral Development Theory

Kohlberg's Moral Development Theory explains that moral reasoning develops progressively through different stages, ranging from self-interest-based decisions to principled ethical judgment. According to Kohlberg, moral development involves the ability to make reasoned ethical decisions based on universal principles and values.

In the context of value education, this theory supports the assessment of students' moral judgment, ethical reasoning, decision-making abilities, and understanding of right and wrong. It highlights the importance of evaluating not only behavior but also the reasoning processes underlying moral actions.

3. Character Education Theory

Character Education Theory, particularly as developed by Lickona (1991), emphasizes three essential components of character formation:

- Moral Knowing
- Moral Feeling
- Moral Action

This theory suggests that effective value education should develop students' understanding of moral values, their emotional commitment to those values, and their ability to translate values into consistent behavior. These three dimensions provide an important framework for evaluating character development outcomes.

4. CIPP Evaluation Model

The CIPP Evaluation Model, developed by Daniel Stufflebeam, provides a systematic framework for evaluating educational programs through four dimensions:

- Context Evaluation – assessment of needs, goals, and educational environment.
- Input Evaluation – assessment of resources, strategies, and planning.
- Process Evaluation – assessment of program implementation and instructional practices.
- Product Evaluation – assessment of outcomes and overall effectiveness.

The CIPP model serves as a comprehensive evaluation framework that enables the assessment of both the implementation process and the outcomes of value education programs.

5. Holistic Education Theory

Holistic Education Theory advocates the balanced development of the whole person rather than focusing exclusively on academic achievement. It emphasizes the integration of:

- Cognitive development
- Affective development
- Behavioral development
- Spiritual development
- Social development

This theory supports the view that educational evaluation should measure multiple dimensions of human growth and well-being. It provides a foundation for assessing the overall impact of value education on students' personal and social development.

6. Islamic Educational Theory (Tarbiyah and Insan Kamil)

Islamic Educational Theory is based on the concept of *tarbiyah* (holistic nurturing and development) and aims to produce *insan kamil* (the complete and balanced individual). Islamic education seeks the harmonious development of all aspects of human personality through the integration of faith, knowledge, and practice.

The major dimensions of Islamic educational development include:

- Faith (Iman) – strengthening belief in Allah and Islamic teachings.
- Worship (Ibadah) – commitment to religious practices and spiritual discipline.
- Character (Akhlaq) – development of noble moral conduct and ethical behavior.
- Social Responsibility (Muamalah) – positive interaction, service, and responsibility toward society.
- Spiritual Development (Ruhiyyah) – nurturing spiritual consciousness and piety.
- Intellectual Development (Aqliyyah) – acquisition and application of knowledge.
- Moral Development (Akhlaqiyyah) – cultivation of virtuous character.
- Social Development (Ijtima'iyyah) – active participation and contribution to the community.

From an Islamic perspective, educational evaluation should assess not only academic achievement but also the extent to which Islamic values are internalized and manifested in students' attitudes, behavior, worship practices, and social interactions.

Theoretical Framework Synthesis

Collectively, these theories provide a comprehensive foundation for evaluating Islamic values education. Bloom's Taxonomy addresses learning domains, Kohlberg's theory explains moral reasoning, Lickona's Character Education Theory focuses on character formation, the CIPP Model provides a systematic evaluation framework, Holistic Education Theory emphasizes whole-person development, and Islamic Educational Theory establishes the spiritual and moral objectives of education. Together, these theories support the development of a multidimensional evaluation model that assesses cognitive, affective, behavioral, spiritual, and social outcomes in schools and madrasahs.

This consolidated section creates a strong theoretical foundation for your proposed Comprehensive Evaluation Model for Islamic Values Education in Schools and Mada'ris and aligns well with Master's, PhD, and journal publication standards.

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

This study employs a qualitative library research design aimed at developing a comprehensive evaluation model for Islamic values education in schools and madrasahs. The research involves the systematic review and analysis of relevant literature, educational evaluation models, Islamic educational philosophies, policy documents, scholarly publications, and empirical studies related to value education, character development, and educational assessment.

Library research was selected because it enables the synthesis of existing theoretical and conceptual knowledge to formulate a holistic evaluation framework that integrates contemporary educational evaluation approaches with Islamic educational principles.

Sources of Data

The study utilizes both primary and secondary sources to ensure a comprehensive understanding of value education evaluation.

Primary Sources

The primary sources include:

- The Qur'an
- Hadith literature
- Classical Islamic educational texts
- Books on educational evaluation
- Character education literature
- Islamic education literature

Secondary Sources

The secondary sources include:

- Peer-reviewed journal articles
- Books on Islamic education and educational assessment
- Educational evaluation studies
- Government educational policies
- International educational reports
- Research reports related to character and values education

Data Analysis Method

The collected data were analyzed using qualitative thematic content analysis. The analysis followed several stages:

1. Data Collection – gathering relevant literature and documentary sources.
2. Data Classification – organizing sources according to themes and concepts.
3. Thematic Coding – identifying key concepts, dimensions, indicators, and evaluation practices.
4. Comparative Analysis – comparing existing educational evaluation models and Islamic educational frameworks.
5. Conceptual Model Development – synthesizing findings to construct a comprehensive evaluation model.

The data were subsequently categorized, interpreted, and synthesized to formulate a multidimensional framework for evaluating Islamic values education.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Main Analysis: Proposed Comprehensive Evaluation Model

Based on the literature review and theoretical synthesis, the study proposes a Comprehensive Islamic Values Education Evaluation Model that integrates institutional, instructional, and student-development dimensions. The model combines educational evaluation principles, character education frameworks, and Islamic educational objectives.

The model consists of six interconnected dimensions:

Dimension	Evaluation Focus
Context	Vision, mission, policies, institutional goals, and resource support
Curriculum	Integration of Islamic values and learning objectives
Teaching and Learning	Pedagogical approaches, teacher role-modeling, and classroom implementation
Student Development	Knowledge, attitudes, spirituality, behavior, and leadership
Institutional Culture	School environment, Islamic practices, and organizational climate
Community Impact	Family engagement, community participation, and social contribution

Evaluation Indicators

1. Context Evaluation

Indicators:

- Institutional vision and mission
- Islamic educational objectives
- Policy support
- Resource availability
- Leadership commitment

2. Curriculum Evaluation

Indicators:

- Integration of Islamic values
- Learning objectives
- Religious and moral content
- Learning materials
- Cross-curricular integration

3. Teaching and Learning Evaluation

Indicators:

- Teaching methods
- Teacher role-modeling
- Classroom interaction
- Learning activities
- Student engagement

4. Student Development Evaluation

Indicators:

- Islamic knowledge and understanding
- Moral and ethical awareness
- Worship practices
- Social responsibility
- Leadership and citizenship
- Behavioral conduct

5. Institutional Culture Evaluation
Indicators:
- Daily Islamic practices
- Congregational prayer activities
- Religious celebrations
- School climate
- Value-based disciplinary practices

6. Community Impact Evaluation
Indicators:
- Parent involvement
- Community service activities
- Social engagement
- Graduate behavior
- Community perception

Student Outcome Assessment Dimensions

To assess the effectiveness of value education comprehensively, student outcomes should be evaluated across five domains:

Domain	**Indicators**	**Assessment Methods**
Cognitive	Knowledge of Islamic values, ethics, and moral principles	Tests, essays, interviews
Affective	Attitudes, commitment, and value internalization	Surveys, reflection journals, self-assessment
Behavioral	Observable conduct and character practices	Observation checklists, teacher reports
Social	Interpersonal relationships and community engagement	Peer assessment, parent feedback, community evaluation
Spiritual	Faith, worship practices, and religious commitment	Self-report, teacher evaluation, spiritual portfolios

Comprehensive Evaluation Framework

The proposed evaluation process follows a continuous improvement cycle:

Context and Inputs → Curriculum and Learning Process → Value Internalization → Behavioral and Spiritual Practice → Comprehensive Evaluation → Feedback and Improvement

This framework recognizes that value education is not merely an instructional process but a transformative process that influences students' beliefs, attitudes, behaviors, and social interactions.

Comparative Analysis

Traditional Evaluation versus Comprehensive Islamic Values Evaluation

Aspect	**Traditional Evaluation**	**Comprehensive Islamic Values Evaluation**
Focus	Academic achievement	Holistic human development

Assessment Instruments	Written examinations	Multiple assessment tools
Evaluators	Teachers only	Teachers, peers, parents, and community
Frequency	Periodic assessment	Continuous and developmental assessment
Domains Assessed	Primarily cognitive	Cognitive, affective, behavioral, social, and spiritual
Scope	Classroom performance	School culture, family, and community impact
Outcomes	Grades and academic performance	Character formation, value internalization, and social responsibility

DISCUSSION

The findings of this study indicate that effective Islamic values education requires a multidimensional evaluation system that extends beyond conventional academic assessment. Traditional evaluation methods tend to focus primarily on cognitive achievement through written examinations and standardized testing, often neglecting the affective, behavioral, spiritual, and social dimensions that are fundamental to both value education and Islamic educational objectives. As a result, such approaches provide only a partial understanding of students' overall development and the effectiveness of value education programs.

The proposed Comprehensive Islamic Values Education Evaluation Model addresses this limitation by integrating multiple theoretical perspectives, including the CIPP Evaluation Model, Character Education Theory, Holistic Education Theory, Bloom's Taxonomy, and Islamic Educational Theory. Through this integration, evaluation becomes a continuous and comprehensive process that examines not only educational outcomes but also the contextual, curricular, instructional, institutional, and community factors that influence value formation. The model enables educators to assess institutional conditions, curriculum implementation, teaching and learning practices, student development, school culture, and community impact within a unified framework.

Furthermore, the findings suggest that the evaluation of Islamic values education should encompass multiple domains of student development, including cognitive understanding, affective commitment, behavioral practice, social responsibility, and spiritual growth. Effective assessment must therefore measure not only what students know about values but also the extent to which those values are internalized and reflected in their attitudes, decisions, relationships, and daily conduct. This perspective is consistent with the Islamic educational goal of developing *insan salih* (righteous individuals) who embody faith (*iman*), piety (*taqwa*), noble character (*akhlaq*), and social responsibility.

Another significant finding is the importance of involving multiple stakeholders in the evaluation process. The inclusion of teachers, parents, peers, school administrators, and community members enhances the reliability and authenticity of assessment by providing diverse perspectives on students' value development. Such collaboration strengthens the connection between school-based learning and real-life application, ensuring that values taught within educational institutions are reinforced in family and community settings. This shared responsibility promotes greater consistency in character formation and value internalization across different social environments.

The proposed model also supports formative and developmental assessment practices by emphasizing continuous monitoring, reflection, and feedback rather than merely measuring final outcomes. Regular feedback allows educators and students to identify strengths, address weaknesses, and make ongoing improvements in the teaching and learning process. Consequently, evaluation becomes a tool for educational enhancement and character development rather than solely a mechanism for accountability.

Overall, the findings demonstrate that a comprehensive approach to evaluation is essential for accurately assessing the effectiveness of Islamic values education. By integrating educational and Islamic perspectives, the proposed framework offers a practical and theoretically grounded model that can assist educators, school leaders, policymakers, and researchers in evaluating and improving value education programs in schools and madrasahs. Ultimately, the model contributes to the development of educational environments that foster intellectual excellence, spiritual maturity, moral integrity, and social responsibility among learners.

CONCLUSION

This study developed a Comprehensive Evaluation Model for Islamic Values Education in schools and madrasahs to address the limitations of traditional assessment systems, which often focus primarily on academic achievement and cognitive outcomes. The findings demonstrate that effective evaluation of Islamic values education requires a multidimensional and holistic framework capable of assessing not only students' knowledge but also the internalization and manifestation of values in their attitudes, behaviors, spiritual practices, and social interactions.

The study concludes that Islamic values education should be evaluated through multiple interconnected dimensions. At the institutional level, evaluation should encompass context, curriculum, teaching and learning processes, student development, institutional culture, and community impact. At the learner level, assessment should address cognitive, affective, behavioral, social, and spiritual domains simultaneously to provide a comprehensive understanding of students' character formation and value development.

The findings further indicate that existing assessment approaches are insufficient for measuring value internalization, moral growth, and character development. Therefore, effective value education assessment should utilize diverse assessment instruments, including tests, observations, reflective journals, interviews, self-assessments, peer assessments, and community feedback. Such an approach allows for a more authentic and comprehensive evaluation of students' development.

In addition, the study emphasizes the importance of involving multiple stakeholders—including teachers, school administrators, parents, peers, and community members—in the evaluation process. Continuous monitoring, reflection, and feedback are essential for supporting ongoing improvement and ensuring that educational objectives are translated into meaningful behavioral and spiritual outcomes.

The proposed model integrates contemporary educational evaluation theories with Islamic educational principles, thereby aligning academic, moral, spiritual, and social objectives. By combining educational effectiveness with the broader goals of Islamic character formation, the framework provides a practical and theoretically grounded approach for evaluating and improving Islamic values education in schools and madrasahs.

Ultimately, the model offers educators, policymakers, and researchers a comprehensive tool for assessing the effectiveness of value education programs and strengthening the development of learners who embody faith (*iman*), piety (*taqwa*), noble character (*akhlaq*), and social responsibility. Future empirical studies are recommended to test, validate, and refine the model across diverse educational contexts and cultural settings.

REFERENCES

Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1991). *The concept of education in Islam: A framework for an Islamic philosophy of education*. International Institute of Islamic Thought and Civilization.

Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1999). *The educational philosophy and practice of Syed Muhammad Naquib Al-Attas: An exposition of the original concept of Islamization*. International Institute of Islamic Thought and Civilization.
Al-Ghazali. (2005). *Ihya ulum al-din* (Rev. ed.). Dar Al-Kotob Al-Ilmiyyah.
An-Nahlawi, A. (1995). *Principles and methods of Islamic education*. Dar Al-Fikr.
Ashraf, S. A. (1985). *New horizons in Muslim education*. Hodder & Stoughton.
Berkowitz, M. W., & Bier, M. C. (2005). What works in character education: A research-driven guide for educators. *Character Education Partnership*.
Bloom, B. S. (Ed.). (1956). *Taxonomy of educational objectives: The classification of educational goals. Handbook I: Cognitive domain*. Longmans, Green and Co.
Creswell, J. W. (2018). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (5th ed.). Sage Publications.
Halstead, J. M. (2007). Islamic values: A distinctive framework for moral education? *Journal of Moral Education, 36*(3), 283–296.
Hasan Langgulung. (1988). *Asas-asas pendidikan Islam*. Pustaka Al-Husna.
Kohlberg, L. (1984). *Essays on moral development: Vol. 2. The psychology of moral development*. Harper & Row.
Lickona, T. (1991). *Educating for character: How our schools can teach respect and responsibility*. Bantam Books.
Lickona, T. (2004). *Character matters: How to help our children develop good judgment, integrity, and other essential virtues*. Simon & Schuster.
Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). Jossey-Bass.
Muhaimin. (2004). *Paradigma pendidikan Islam: Upaya mengefektifkan pendidikan agama Islam di sekolah*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
Nucci, L. P., & Narvaez, D. (Eds.). (2008). *Handbook of moral and character education*. Routledge.
Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (4th ed.). Sage Publications.
Ryan, K., & Bohlin, K. E. (1999). *Building character in schools: Practical ways to bring moral instruction to life*. Jossey-Bass.
Stufflebeam, D. L. (2003). The CIPP model for evaluation. In T. Kellaghan & D. L. Stufflebeam (Eds.), *International handbook of educational evaluation* (pp. 31–62). Kluwer Academic Publishers.
Stufflebeam, D. L., & Coryn, C. L. S. (2014). *Evaluation theory, models, and applications* (2nd ed.). Jossey-Bass.
Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2017). *The CIPP evaluation model: How to evaluate for improvement and accountability*. Guilford Press.
Tilaar, H. A. R. (2002). *Pendidikan, kebudayaan, dan masyarakat madani Indonesia*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
UNESCO. (2021). *Reimagining our futures together: A new social contract for education*. UNESCO Publishing.
Yusuf al-Qaradawi. (1999). *Education and the Muslim community*. Islamic Book Trust.
Zuchdi, D. (2010). *Humanisasi pendidikan: Menemukan kembali pendidikan yang manusiawi*. Bumi Aksara.
The Holy Qur'an.
Al-Bukhari, M. I. (2002). *Sahih al-Bukhari* (M. M. Khan, Trans.). Darussalam.
Muslim, I. (2007). *Sahih Muslim* (N. Siddiqui, Trans.). Darussalam.
Abdullah, M. A. (2006). *Islamic studies in higher education in Indonesia: Challenges, impact and prospects for the world community*. Al-Jami'ah Journal of Islamic Studies, 44(1), 1–23.
Alavi, H. R. (2008). Nearness to God: A perspective on Islamic education. *Religious Education, 103*(1), 5–21.
Cook, B. J. (2010). Islamic versus Western conceptions of education: Reflections on Egypt. *International Review of Education, 45*(3–4), 339–357.
Hashim, R. (2014). Educational dualism in Malaysia: Implications for theory and practice. *Oxford University Press*.
Hussain, A. (2004). Islamic education: Why is there a need for it? *Journal of Beliefs & Values, 25*(3), 317–323.
Wan Daud, W. M. N. (1998). *The educational philosophy and practice of Syed Muhammad Naquib Al-Attas*. International Institute of Islamic Thought and Civilization.